

CITY OF CHARLEVOIX
SPECIAL JOINT CITY COUNCIL/DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY MEETING MINUTES
Monday, August 9, 2012 — 6:00 p.m.

408 Bridge Street [East Park, Plaza B] and 210 State Street, City Hall, Council Chambers, Charlevoix, MI

The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Mayor Pro Tem Jill Picha.

I. Pledge of Allegiance

II. Roll Call of Members Present

Mayor: Mayor Pro Tem Jill Picha
City Manager: Rob Straebel
DDA Director: Keith Carey
City Clerk: Carol A. Ochs
Members Present: Council members Jill Picha, Greg Stevens, Bryan Vollmer, Shane Cole, Lyle Gennett, Dennis Kusina
DDA members Hugh Mason, Dan Barron, Fred DiMartino
Absent: DDA members Mayor Norman L. Carlson, Jr., Jeannine Wallace, Todd Wyett, Gina Whitney, Kirby Dipert,
John Yaroch

No quorum for the DDA. They will be unable to make or vote on motions. They may make public comments. [A copy of the minutes will not be filed as official minutes of the DDA.]

III. Tour East Park

A. Discussion Regarding Proposal to Construct a Natural Gas Fireplace in East Park

John Winn presented the item for Council. Council discussed the location and types of benches. It was proposed that the tree be removed and the fireplace centered on Plaza B. Street Superintendent Pat Elliott stated that the City did not have enough pavers to pave the whole area, should the tree be removed. Mr. Winn stated that he could get pavers donated to match. Council will continue the discussion when the meeting reconvenes at City Hall.

B. Consideration to Plant Shade Trees in East Park

Street Superintendent Pat Elliott stated that the locations shown on the previous Photoshop presentation had been marked with an "X". After Staff visited the Park, alternative spots had also been marked based on the views. Members walked around the park, discussing various locations and the view corridor. Council will continue the discussion when the meeting reconvenes at City Hall.

IV. Recess

Mayor Pro Tem Picha called brief recess at 6:25 p.m. to relocate to Council Chambers at City Hall.

V. Reconvene Meeting at City Hall – Roll Call

Mayor Pro Tem Picha reconvened the meeting at 6:32 p.m. in Council Chambers at City Hall.

Mayor: Mayor Pro Tem Jill Picha
City Manager: Rob Straebel
DDA Director: Keith Carey
City Clerk: Carol A. Ochs
Members Present: Council members Jill Picha, Greg Stevens, Bryan Vollmer, Shane Cole, Lyle Gennett, Dennis Kusina
DDA members Hugh Mason, Dan Barron, Fred DiMartino
Absent: DDA members Mayor Norman L. Carlson, Jr., Jeannine Wallace, Todd Wyett, Gina Whitney, Kirby Dipert,
John Yaroch

No quorum for the DDA. They will be unable to make or vote on motions. They may make public comments. [A copy of the minutes will not be filed as official minutes of the DDA.]

VI. Inquiry Regarding Possible Conflicts of Interest

Council member Shane Cole stated that his wife is the marketing director for DTE. The proposed fireplace will be gas, therefore his family would profit from the installation of the fireplace. He will abstain from the discussion for the fireplace.

VII. Requests, Petitions and Communications and Actions Thereon

A. Discussion Regarding Proposal to Construct a Natural Gas Fireplace in East Park

The City Manager reviewed the costs for installation of a gas line (\$1,800) as well as the legacy costs of the actual fuel (~\$6,700/yr.) and maintenance (unknown). Construction costs of the fireplace will be covered by Mr. Winn and an anonymous benefactor. Attachment A in the Council packet outlines the responsibilities of Mr. Winn and his benefactor as well as those of the City.

Council members and the DDA members present spoke in favor of removing the tree and centering the fireplace in Plaza B to make it the focal point. Once again, it was pointed out that there were not enough pavers for the whole plaza. John Winn stated that he was sure he could get matching pavers donated. The City Manager cautioned Council that removing a tree could cause some community unrest.

Council discussed annual costs. Mr. Elliott stated that costs could fluctuate, depending on the number of hours of operation. The Manager stated that, according to Emmet Brick & Block, long term maintenance on the fireplace itself should be minimal, but the annual natural gas costs are something to consider. Mr. Winn answered questions regarding pipe size, flame height, and timers. The Manager confirmed for Council that the City could easily afford the costs of the gas line installation. He stated that the annual costs for fuel would not break the budget, but also pointed out that the nature of the project did run a little contrary to the green, energy saving projects the City has been working on. However, the amenity as a nice addition to the park may balance that out. Council discussed the removal of the tree and various options that might be available for replacing it at another location.

Motion by Council member Dennis Kusina, seconded by Councilmember Greg Stevens, to approve Attachment A, Scope of Work – Community Fireplace [pp. 3-4 of the Council packet], with the condition that the fireplace be centered in Plaza B and the tree be removed.

Yeas: Picha, Stevens, Vollmer, Gennett, Kusina
Nays: None
Absent: None
Abstain: Cole

B. Consideration to Plant Shade Trees in East Park

The Mayor Pro Tem opened the item to Council. Councilmember Vollmer stated that he felt there was no point in pursuing planting trees at this time; the proposed locations chosen to keep everyone happy—preserving views, accommodating vendors—don't serve

much purpose for families using the park and wanting shade. Councilmember Kusina agreed, stating that, although the fireplace needed a decision tonight, there was no rush on deciding on the location of trees. More time and investigation is needed before making the decision. Councilmember Cole also concurred. Councilmember Stevens suggested alternative locations to keep view corridors open, such as moving the trees further north and west. Mr. Stevens stated that Mr. Elliott had indicated trees would not be planted until fall, so he agreed that there was no rush to make a decision tonight. He is not opposed to putting in trees, but thinks the location needs to be carefully chosen. Councilmember Gennett spoke in favor of putting in trees. The locations could be moved. Mr. Gennett stated that the trees are being donated, the City just needs to put them in. He has watched people move tables considerable distances to put them in shade. DDA Chair Hugh Mason reminded Council that several public hearings and surveys had been held when the park was being designed and the number one concern was the preservation of views. DDA member Dan Barron suggested several other options for providing shade in the park; he was opposed to putting any trees in the park. DDA member Fred DiMartino spoke against adding trees to the park. The Mayor Pro Tem stated that some people had complained to her that they don't like the orientation of the new docks, as it impedes the view.

Motion by Council member Bryan Vollmer, seconded by Councilmember Dennis Kusina, not to plant trees in East Park.

Yeas: Picha, Vollmer, Kusina
Nays: Stevens, Cole, Gennett
Absent: None
Tie vote. MOTION FAILS.

The Clerk explained that, because the Mayor was not present to break the tie, the motion fails. However, this merely means that Council may consider the item again in the future. Staff would not take it upon themselves to install trees in East Park, and Council could reasonably assume that the reverse motion would again end in a tie tonight. Council members could request staff to put the item on the agenda again sometime in the future.

VIII. Audience - Non-agenda Input (written requests take precedent)

A member of the audience asked if the meetings were videotaped and televised. They are not.

IX. Adjourn

The Mayor stated if there were no objections, the meeting would adjourn.

There were no objections.

Meeting adjourned at 6:58 p.m.

Carol A. Ochs

City Clerk

Jill Picha

Mayor Pro Tem